

England. He enlisted in Richmond, Melbourne, on 22 September 1915, describing himself as a 'driver', and gave his age as 30 years 10 months. His height was 5 feet 2 inches. By the time that he embarked for overseas service in January 1916, Freudenthal was attached to the 46th Battalion. His unit was involved in First Bullecourt in April 1917, and Freudenthal found himself a POW, one of 1142 Australian prisoners of that action. He was sent to Fort MacDonald in Lille, where he spent seven days in conditions he described as 'disgraceful'. 'We then worked at various places behind the lines under our own shell fire. I arrived at Schneidemuhl in Germany on December 2, 1917 and was sent out on working "commando" looking after sheep. The treatment was very fair'. Freudenthal arrived at Danzig on 13 December 1918 where he 'embarked on the *Mitan* and arrived at Leith on December 18, 1918' on his way back to Australia.

Thus, this book provides further information on Monash as well as adding the name of Freudenthal to the list of Jewish soldiers who served during World War I. Williams also sheds further light on the undercurrent of antisemitism in Australia in this period.

Russell W Stern

RUSSIAN ANZACS IN AUSTRALIAN HISTORY

By Elena Govor, UNSW Press in association with National Archives of Australia, Sydney, 2005.

Elena Govor has delved into the records held by the National Archives of Australia and the Australian War Memorial during the course of her four years' research into the background and treatment by Australian authorities of about 1,000 men who were born within the Russian Empire in the nineteenth century and who enlisted in the Australian Imperial Force (AIF) in World War I. She has the advantage of herself being Russian born and thus being able to understand the problems that the subjects of her research faced in their new country, many within months of the war.

The author has treated as 'Russian' anyone who was born in the Russian Empire, which at the time included part of Poland, Finland, and the Baltic States. She has divided her subjects by ethnicity into Eastern Slavs, Poles, Baltic peoples, Finns and Jews. It is because she has consciously distinguished between other 'Russians' and

those who had a Jewish background that this book is an important addition to an Australian Jewish Historical Library. The Appendices that she has provided allow us to consider afresh the situation that our Russian Jewish immigrants faced upon their arrival in Australia. These are based on her analysis of service records and other archival files.

One of the Tables sets out the ethnic breakdown of Russian Anzacs, and here she indicates that Jews, including those from Poland and the Baltic Provinces comprised 11.10% of the 946 enlisted men that she identified as clearly Russian, and 105 in number. The Tables include a listing of ethnic breakdown: Russian Anzacs vs the overall Russian community; enlistment, proportionally by state and ethnicity; age structure of Russian ethnic groups; occupations at enlistment, proportionately; and religious persuasion – distribution of professed denominations among Russian ethnic groups. All of these Tables treat Jews as a separate ethnicity. The table that is missing is one that sets out all the names of those Gover identified as Russian and their ethnicity. One has to read the book closely to identify her subjects and their fate.

Many of the Russian Jews mentioned in the text are recorded in Harold Boas' *Australian Jewry Book of Honour* published in 1923. However, almost a dozen ex-Russian Jews referred to in Gover's opus are not mentioned in Boas. Where that is the case, I have set out in the footnotes at the end of this review, the relevant words of Gover's text. That way, future researchers into Australian Jewish involvement in the 'Great War of 1914-1918' will be able to readily add to Harold Boas' listing.

One of the things that this book demonstrates is that the view of the Anzacs as handed down from Charles Bean and his war histories as being Anglo-Celtic must be revised. The Anzacs were multicultural and the Australian Army of 1914 also included Germans, French, Russians, Greeks, Italians as well as Indigenous Australians. Their numbers were not insignificant, contra Bean. This is not surprising given Bean's well known Anglo-centric views and antisemitism.

Gover's treatment is to concern herself with individual, perhaps representative, Russians of each ethnicity, and to ask why they came to Australia. Much of this information has been gleaned from her interviews with descendants, though she confesses that often the archival material provides more information than was passed on by the Anzacs.

Her section on 'Other Russian Subjects', which includes Jews, looks at the origins and patterns of arrival, the social and occupational background, the treatment meted out to Jews by the Russian

authorities, summed up in the question that her Jewish interviewees put back to her, sometimes aloud, sometimes silently, "Are you Jewish?". This section looks at the background of Jack Kanaef, Moisey Kotton, Louis Brodsky¹, Nathan Krausman, the families Lakovsky, Lebovich and Rappeport, Samuel Ettingove and Nahum Myer, Haim Platkin, Frank Bernard Hershorn Lesnie, Abraham Levene² and Sidney Ivor Luck³ and also mentions Morris Saffar (or Moishe Seifer)⁴.

Following this introduction, Gover analyses the enlistment process. She notes that at least a quarter of all male Russian immigrants to Australia joined the AIF. Many enlisted in preference to being hungry, some were enticed by the 6/- a day, while others were pressured by Russian officials in Australia. Filling in the enlistment form posed problems to Russians who spoke little English, and our author examines with humour the enlistment forms that she has studied.

Gover continues by looking at the campaigns fought during the War, and the involvement of Russians in these actions. The war effort of Eliezer Margolin is considered at some length, as he achieved the highest rank (Lieut. Colonel) in the AIF of all those who were foreign born. This section of the book also considers the treatment meted out by army authorities who suspected non-English speakers of disloyalty, notwithstanding admitted gallantry in action. Gover suggests that this attitude was not dissimilar to that of the Russian Red Army in the panic and confusion immediately following the German invasion of Russia in 1941.

The names George Ferber⁵, Yur Kinovitch⁶, Abraham Smoishen⁷ as well as that of Lion Harlap are mentioned in reference to the Light Horse campaign against the Turks in Sinai and Palestine. France, 1916 sees the names of Wolf Dorfman, taken prisoner and Gershon Harbart, killed, missing in action, while a letter from Frank Bernard Hershorn Lesnie, written after an action in July 1916 is cited. These three are mentioned in Boas, as is George Breitman, but not Louis Pasvalsky⁸ killed at Mouquet Farm on 3 September 1916. For 1917 mention is made of Second Bullecourt where Frank Goldstein and Ben Goffin were wounded. Unusually, Gover does not mention their Jewishness though she does when later referring to Gregory Kunin⁹, a good friend of Goffin, who was killed at Messines. Again, Gover notes the deaths in action in 1918 of David Minor and Morris Lebovitch, and the award of the Military Medal to Samuel Harold Krantz at Hamel in July. The last death of a Russian Jew that Kover records was that of Moisey Kotton in September 1918.

Other names mentioned in the text include David Waxman, and

Paul Ephraim Zundolovich, who Gover suggests was of Jewish background because of his name and birthplace in Lithuania, even though he was a Roman Catholic priest.

Gover does not just consider the wartime activities of her subjects. She also looks at their treatment as Russians amongst Australians, as well as their treatment following the Russian Revolution and the distrust of the Bolsheviks, the feeling that all Russians were Reds. The concluding sections of the book review the life of her Russian Anzacs in Australia after their repatriation. Here we meet Jack Kaneaf who had been discharged from the AIF because of insufficient English¹⁰ and Samuel Waxman¹¹.

Russian Anzacs is a fascinating book, and Elena Gover is to be commended upon the research she undertook, which has resulted in these stories of immigrants to Australia from Russia who enlisted in the AIF and again, in a number of cases, volunteered for service in World War II, as well as for describing their post-war life in Australia and elsewhere.

Russell W. Stern

1. Not mentioned in Boas, a photo, in uniform, with his family, appears on p.71. He was from a poor background in Odessa, and left home before he was a teenager. When the war started he was a family man in Australia; he ran a shop with a big 2/6 sign on the window for clothes cleaning and dyeing. He made many efforts to enlist but was repeatedly rejected because of his poor teeth. He campaigned against the army authorities so vigorously that the press publicised his case. He was authorised to establish a corps of men rejected only for poor teeth. On reaching Egypt he realised that the army was not the place for him and sought a discharge, which was refused so he took French leave and assumed the identity of a Russian refugee named David Lipshitz whose papers he purchased. In this guise he worked as a steward on various ships, eventually returning to Australia, where he gave himself up to the military authorities in 1918, but was not prosecuted.
2. Abraham Levene enlisted in the AIF as David Conroy, a Briton born in Glasgow. He died at Gallipoli. He had in fact been born in Russia.
3. Sidney Ivor Luck who had worked as a surveyor at Broken Hill, had left Poland as a child with his parents and was educated at the London School of Mines.
4. Morris Saffar was an engineer. When applying for Australian naturalisation he passed himself off as a Frenchman, identifying with where he had settled, rather than the country in which he had been born.
5. George Ferber was a draper, although his enlistment papers state that he was a stockman.
6. Yur Kinovitch was a tradesman
7. Abraham Smoishen was a tailor; suffered from malaria and gastritis

8. He is described as 'an 18-year old Jewish boy from Perth, a former metal polisher, whose family were from Opochna in Russia. He was a very bright little Russian according to his comrades and only 5 feet 2 inches tall, with dark curly hair'.
9. Gregory Kunin was from the Pale, enlisting as a carpenter and seaman.
10. After the war he worked as an electrician, was involved in the electrification of the Canberra-Queanbeyan area.
11. Samuel Waxman had worked at Myers before his enlistment. After the war he opened a clothing shop in Adelaide.

MAD FOR ZION A BIOGRAPHY OF COLONEL J.H. PATTERSON

by Patrick Streeter, *The Matching Press, Harlow U.K. 2004,*
191pp.

The reader of the *AJHS Journal* might ask why a review of a biography of Lieut. Colonel John Henry Patterson has been included. While he may have been "Mad for Zion", what was his Australian Jewish connection?

Patterson was a colourful, self-made adventurer, apparently born on the wrong side of the blanket in 1867 to an established Anglo-Irish family. He enlisted as a private in the British Army, rising to the rank of sergeant in India when he left the army in 1897 to work as an engineer building the Mombasa-Uganda railway. Work was hindered by man-eating lions attacking the Indian workmen. Patterson eventually shot the lions, and later recorded the story in *The Man-Eaters of Tsavo*. This became the background for the film *The Ghost and the Darkness* (1997) starring Michael Douglas and Val Kilmer.

The Boer War and the raising of the Imperial Yeomanry in 1900 saw Patterson gazetted a Second Lieutenant, campaigning in South Africa. By early 1902 he had risen to Lieutenant Colonelcy and been awarded a DSO.

By 1907 Patterson had been appointed as Chief Game Warden in British East Africa based in Nairobi. He led a safari accompanied by a brother-officer, Lieutenant Audley Blyth with his young wife, Effie. Patterson had an affair with Effie, and Blyth shot himself. The story inspired Ernest Hemingway's novella *The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber*, filmed as *The Macomber Affair* in 1947.

In 1915 Patterson, having rejoined the British Army, was in Egypt where a Boer War colleague was looking for a commander for