

centres and libraries relevant to the study of the *Dunera*, and *Dunera* 'songs and poems'. Few if any of these will be known even to keen students of this affair, and it is a tribute to the assiduousness of the editor to have unearthed so many records of this kind. Reading them allows us to view the *Dunera* through the primary materials of their actual history rather than through the interpretative eyes of the historian, and to draw our own conclusions. This places a considerable responsibility on readers, some of whom may have preferred to be spoon-fed.

As several excellent narrative histories of the *Dunera* have appeared, chiefly those by Benzion Patkin and Cyril Pearl, to say nothing of television mini-series, now readily available from video rental outlets, the Jewish Museum was, I think, entirely correct to honour the *Dunera*'s anniversary in so strikingly original a way, especially as the *Dunera* may be unique in Australian Jewish history in the depth of relevant official sources which the historian can consult. *The Dunera Affair* will be equally useful to tertiary history lecturers attempting to teach students how to grapple successfully with historical evidence, and is virtually a model of its kind in this respect.

Because of the attention it has attracted since the publication of Benzion Patkin's book in 1979 and Cyril Pearl's in 1983, followed by the popular television series, it is quite possible that the *Dunera* is, to the non-Jewish public, now the best known single incident in the whole of Australian Jewish history. Although several factors help to account for this, including, arguably, the element of 'Pommy-bashing' implicit in both the mindless deportation, and the brutality of the guards, as well as the fact that this is one of the few aspects of our history which impinge directly on the Holocaust, the continuing fascination of this affair is undeniable. Since Australians can take a considerable degree of pride in both their own humanity and the material benefits derived from those '*Dunera* boys' who remained here, this is understandable.

Nevertheless, as Dr. Bartrop wisely cautions us elsewhere in this *Journal*, it is important not to exaggerate the wickedness of the *Dunera* affair, and perhaps the most certain lesson to be drawn is that in democracies permeated by the rule of law, democracy, and tolerance, justice usually triumphs in the long run, however much their values may be mocked in the short term. This is precisely the opposite of that which obtains in totalitarian societies. Dr. Bartrop and the Jewish Museum have produced a volume whose implications are far-reaching indeed.

Professor W. D. Rubinstein

THE DUNERA SCANDAL

Cyril Pearl (originally 1983; this edition Port Melbourne: Mandarin Australia, 1990; 193 pp.)

It is good to see the late Cyril Pearl's pioneering history of the *Dunera* affair back in print, this time in a popular paperback edition. Although Pearl — of course a leading and distinguished journalist and popular writer — did not write the first account of the *Dunera*, his was the version that brought national and international renown to the affair, when it was taken as the basis of the '*Dunera* Boys' television series. The account here is as clear and shocking as it is well-researched. Perhaps its major omission is the total failure to mention, at any place in the work, the first book on this subject, Benzion Patkin's *The Dunera Internees* (Cassell Australia, Stanmore,

NSW, 1979). Although the account by Patkin — the founder of Mount Scopus College and a leading Zionist — is not as well-written as the work by Pearl, the editor of the *Sunday Telegraph* and the author of many books, it is longer and in some ways more comprehensive. Although Pearl must surely have read *The Dunera Internees*, neither Patkin nor his book are mentioned at any stage by Pearl. With Dr. Paul Bartrop's documentary account of the celebrated affair, the *Dunera* is now as well-served by historians as any aspect of Australian Jewish history.

Professor W. D. Rubinstein

SANCTUARY: NAZI FUGITIVES IN AUSTRALIA

Mark Aarons (*Victoria: William Heinemann Australia, 1989, 385pp., hardback, illus.*)

Few books are as long in the making or create such a level of controversy before the book's appearance as Mark Aaron's *Sanctuary*. This book will prove to be a seminal work. This is not just because of its exposé of the fact that there were Nazi collaborators and war criminals among the vast number of innocent displaced persons who arrived as part of Australia's post-war immigration programme, but also because of its analysis of the factors which permitted this process to occur and the 'bureaucratic lies' which shielded these people once they arrived in Australia.

Mark Aarons' book is important because he analyses the whole process in relation to war criminals in Australia with care and precision, giving a detailed overview of every aspect of the issue from the early period in the 1940s until the present contemporary debate. His work is based on thorough research which uses government archives both in Australia and overseas and which builds on the work of previous researchers such as John Playford and the material of the Council to Combat Fascism and anti-Semitism and the Executive Council of Australian Jewry. As a journalist, not a historian, the style of the book tends, in parts, to be rather emotive. Some parts of the book are repetitive and the information is not always presented in what appears to be the most logical order but, despite these deficiencies, the book is a significant contribution to Australian social and political history.

Most Australians when thinking of war criminals in relation to the European Holocaust tend to think of people of German origins but the majority of war criminals who arrived in Australia came from Eastern Europe. The book provides a good background discussion of the various East European Fascist groups such as the Slovene Domobrans, the Hlinka Guard, the Arrow Cross Party, the Iron Guard and the Ustashi. It also gives a detailed discussion of the inadequate screening and the political forces in both Europe and Australia which facilitated the illegal entry of collaborators and war criminals. Both the broad spectrum of events and detailed individual cases are dealt with in the book.

After a general introduction, the book starts with a detailed analysis of one specific case, that of Ljenko Urbancic. Following the Italian capitulation in September 1943, Germany assumed control of the section of Slovenia which had been under Italian rule. Urbancic organised the march by the Slovene Domobrans, the Home Guard, at this time and also worked as a propagandist in the Domobran Information Department. After the war he made his way out of Yugoslavia and found